

Minutes

Transport and Environment Committee

10.00am, Thursday 17 August 2023

Present

Councillors Arthur (Convener), Aston, Bandel, Beal (substituting for Councillor Cowdy, item 5), Cowdy (items 1 to 4 and 6 onwards), Dijkstra-Downie, Dobbin, Faccenda, Lang, McFarlane, Munro and O'Neill.

1. Deputations

a) **Accessible Corstorphine for Everyone
(in relation to item 5 – Business Bulletin - Replacement of the Vandalised Manse Road Bus Gate Camera and Pole)**

The deputation requested the low traffic neighbourhood trial was reversed immediately in full. They requested that the Council engage with local residents and businesses to gather feedback regarding potential areas that required changes or improvements. Proposals should be consulted on in a fair, unbiased and binding way before adjusting plans with any changes only being implemented with the clear majority support from residents. The deputation also shared their belief the Manse Road bus gate camera should be abandoned.

b) **Low Traffic Corstorphine
(in relation to item 5 – Business Bulletin - Replacement of the Vandalised Manse Road Bus Gate Camera and Pole)**

The deputation highlighted there was strong support for the trial low traffic neighbourhood and shared their support for the Manse Road bus gate camera. They requested the trial ETRO remained in place during the project timetable.

The deputation believed developments in West Edinburgh meant the existing infrastructure was not sustainable and community engagement had shown there was demand for change.

The deputation reminded members of the feedback gathered by residents dating from 2016 where suggestions were made to improve traffic flow in the future.

The deputation thanked the officers and members of the Transport and Environment Committee for their continued commitment to listening to all voices within the Corstorphine community.

**c) New Town & Broughton Community Council
(in relation to item 6 – Petition to the CEC Transport and Environment Committee regarding East London Street)**

The deputation expressed strong support for immediate and sustained improvement in the volume and speed of traffic on London Road in what was a largely residential street. This had been a long standing issue, made worse over the last few years due to the Trams to Newhaven Project.

This had resulted in significant damage to the setted street surface adding to the noise and vibration experienced by residents. The deputation proposed that, rather than undertake expensive repairs to the setts, they should be replaced with tarmac on the running lane and traffic calming measures should urgently be investigated.

**d) Keep Morningside Moving
(in relation to item 9 - Response to motion by Councillor Macinnes - Travelling Safely – Braid Road and Comiston Road)**

The deputation thanked the committee members and officers for decisions made at previous Transport and Environment Committee meetings. They shared their suggestion on how to make travel safe for all, cars, cyclists, and pedestrians by re-opening Braid Avenue and making small tweaks and improvements to measures already in place in the area.

**e) Blackford Safe Routes
(in relation to item 9 - Response to motion by Councillor Macinnes - Travelling Safely – Braid Road and Comiston Road)**

The deputation requested all rat runs around the Braid estate were stopped and a full low traffic neighbourhood should be introduced to meet residents' demands for reduced speeds and reduced traffic. The request was also made for low traffic neighbourhoods to be rolled out throughout the city with bus, walk and cycle routes on main roads a priority. The deputation expressed their belief when safe walk, cycle and bus options were made available, the public chose these options.

2. Minutes

Decision

To approve the minute of the Transport and Environment Committee of 15 June 2023 as a correct record.

3. Work Programme

The Transport and Environment Committee Work Programme was presented.

Decision

To note the work programme.

(Reference – Work Programme 17 August 2023, submitted.)

4. Rolling Actions Log

The Transport and Environment Committee Rolling Actions Log was presented.

Decision

- 1) To agree to close the following actions:
 - Action 24 – Active Travel Measures – Travelling Safely Update
 - Action 30 – Motion by Councillor Burgess - Sciennes Primary playground on Sciennes Road
 - Action 32(2) – Brunstane Road Closure – (Progression to a Permanent Traffic Regulation Order)
 - Action 34 – Maintenance of Footways and Cycleways
 - Action 36 – Motion by Councillor Bandel – Mobility Analysis
 - Action 47 - Motion by Councillor Dijkstra-Downie – Class Bus Passes for Schools
 - Action 51 – Secure On-Street Cycle Parking Project – Progress Report

- 2) To note the remaining outstanding actions.

(Reference – Rolling Actions Log 17 August 2023, submitted.)

5. Business Bulletin

The Transport and Environment Committee Business Bulletin was submitted.

Decision

- 1) To note the Business Bulletin.

- 2) To circulate information on the number of incidents of vehicles blocking tramways and associated enforcement activities.

(Reference – Business Bulletin 17 August 2023, submitted.)

6. Petition for Consideration: Petition to the CEC Transport and Environment Committee - East London Street

The Committee were asked to consider a petition submitted on behalf of, and with the support of, residents of East London Street. The petition called for the Council to address the issue of excessive traffic, particularly out-of-service buses, using East London Street to avoid road works and closures associated with various transportation projects in the area.

Decision

- 1) To agree to receive a report within two cycles considering the issues raised by the petitioners and Committee, the Lothian Buses response, and the following issues:
 - that East London Street was a residential, setted street on the edge of the World Heritage Site that had for the duration of the Trams to Newhaven

works been used as a traffic diversion for the rest of Leith Walk. In practice, this meant years of heavy vehicle usage which led to a severe deterioration of the setts.
 - that properties in the area were primarily single glazed due to heritage restrictions and therefore the noise from motor vehicle traffic could be excessive, to the extent that residents had been unable to sleep or use rooms that faced into the street due to the noise disruption.
 - that the road condition further exacerbated this issue due to reverberation and bangs caused by the road surface, and that with the pace of works in current CEC Setted Street Policy it was unlikely to be resurfaced for some time, without an intervention of the Council.
- 2) To request that the report recommended an appropriate course of action, such as:
 - an updated traffic volume and speed survey to be undertaken on East London Street to provide an accurate summary of daytime and nighttime traffic levels.
 - atmospheric pollution monitoring on East London Street.
 - Transport and Environment Convener engagement with Lothian Buses to explore options for reducing the number of off-service buses further than the reductions achieved thus far.

- clarification of the Trams to Newhaven Project's responsibility for reinstatements and other possible routes to fund capital works to fix the sets on East London Street, including the estimated costs for work on this street, and the option of matching London Street, retaining the setts in car parking spaces but tarmacking the central carriageway and the possibility of exploring appropriate traffic calming measures.
- 3) To request Lothian Buses to provide the policies and guidance given to drivers on speed limits and how they were circulated.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

7. Petition for Consideration: Petition to the CEC Transport and Environment Committee - Public Toilets

The Committee were asked to consider a petition "Gorgie Needs a Public Toilet". The petition called on the Council to provide accessible and open public toilets with baby changing and facilities to support all the varied needs of everyone in the Gorgie/Dalry community council area.

Decision

- 1) To agree to receive a report within three cycles considering the issues raised by the petitioners and recommending an appropriate course of action, taking into account the following points:
- that to facilitate the development of the Haymarket Yards, the Council sold the land on which the public conveniences at Morrison Street sat to the developer and a burden was put on the title that any development on this land would provide replacement public conveniences; this was not just a contractual agreement but formed a burden registered in the Land Register of Scotland against the land; such a burden would be made known to a prospective purchaser at the time of sale via a property search.
 - that to date this burden had not been enforced and that legal advice should be taken to update Committee on potential options as this may provide a means for reintroducing public conveniences in the area; and
 - that the Council owned little or no commercial property in the central area of Gorgie-Dalry, where the public toilets previously were on Ardmillan Terrace, other than Gorgie City Farm, and that Edinburgh Voluntary Organisations Council (EVOC) was currently managing a process to find a sustainable community-led future for the Farm.
- 2) To request that the report recommended an appropriate course of action, such as:

Thursday, 17th August, 2023

- exploring with EVOC whether provision of publicly available and accessible toilet facilities could be included in that sustainable future and whether provision of it could form a requirement of a future lease agreement; and
 - exploring other potentially suitable sites and identification of any capital funding for a new public toilet building as part of the emerging Gorgie-Dalry 20-minute neighbourhood project.
- 3) To request the report also included whether the Council could enforce businesses to allow use of their toilet facilities and whether developer contributions could be used for public toilets.

(Reference – report by the Executive Director of Corporate Services, submitted.)

Declaration of interests

Councillors Aston, Bandel and O'Neill made transparency statements in respect of the above item of business as members of Living Rent.

8. Response to Motion by Councillor McFarlane – Tollcross Clock

In response to a motion by Councillor McFarlane, an update was provided on work being undertaken to progress arrangements for the repair and restoration of the Tollcross Clock.

Decision

- 1) To note the update on the current arrangements for the Tollcross Clock and that funding to cover its repair and reinstatement was likely to be covered by the Council's Common Good account.
- 2) To note engagement with key stakeholders would continue to explore potential options for the reinstatement of Tollcross Clock (interim and permanent) and short-term improvements to pedestrian, cycle and public transport at Tollcross Junction as part of the next stage of the Lothian Boulevard project and School Travel Plan Review.
- 3) To note a report would be prepared for Committee once potential options, as noted in point 2 above, had been explored.
- 4) To request a briefing note on the impact on safe routes to schools.

(References – Act of Council No. .. of 24 November 2022; report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

9. Response to Motion by Councillor Macinnes - Travelling Safely – Braid Road and Comiston Road

In response to a motion by Councillor Macinnes, details were provided of the findings from monitoring the impact of changes to the active travel and public transport environment across the area around Braid Road and Comiston Road.

Information was also provided of responses to comments made by Lothian Buses as part of the non-statutory engagement undertaken in May/June 2022 for the Travelling Safely Experimental Traffic Regulation Orders.

Motion

- 1) To note the outcome of the monitoring carried out to understand the impact of changes to the active travel and public transport environment across the area around Braid Road and Comiston Road, as requested by the Committee on 11 November 2021.
 - 2) To note the response to comments received from Lothian Buses as part of the non-statutory engagement undertaken in May/June 2022 for the Travelling Safely Experimental Traffic Regulation Orders (ETROs) (included at Appendix 5 to the report by the Executive Director of Place).
 - 3) To note the decision taken by the Committee on 15 June 2023 on Travelling Safely schemes could result in changes being made to the schemes in this area which could change the monitored impacts, as presented in the report.
 - 4) To note an extensive monitoring and evaluation plan was in place as part of the ETRO process for the Travelling Safely programme and that this would include further monitoring of this area.
 - 5) To note the data relating to the reopening of Braid Road without further consulting local residents regarding the implications; welcomes that the community would now be presented with viable options to protect and improve the aims of the Quiet Route whilst dealing with some of its negative consequences.
 - 6) To note that traffic had not been removed from Waverley Bridge.
 - 7) To request an update before the end of 2023 on the likely delivery schedule of the:
 - 7.1) Waverley/Calton Catalyst Area Project
 - 7.2) Waverley Station Masterplan
 - 7.3) Waterloo Place tour bus trial (all noted in Appendix 5).
- moved by Councillor Arthur, seconded by Councillor Faccenda

Amendment

- 1) To note the outcome of the monitoring carried out to understand the impact of changes to the active travel and public transport environment across the area

around Braid Road and Comiston Road, as requested by the Committee on 11 November 2021.

- 2) To note the response to comments received from Lothian Buses as part of the non-statutory engagement undertaken in May/June 2022 for the Travelling Safely Experimental Traffic Regulation Orders (ETROs) (included at Appendix 5 to the report by the Executive Director of Place).
- 3) To note the decision taken by the Committee on 15 June 2023 on Travelling Safely schemes could result in changes being made to the schemes in this area which could change the monitored impacts, as presented in the report.
- 4) To note an extensive monitoring and evaluation plan was in place as part of the ETRO process for the Travelling Safely programme and that this would include further monitoring of this area.
- 5) To note the 'redesign' and 'adjustments' mentioned in paragraph 5.3 of the report should have climate and accessibility in mind; noting the agreed target for Edinburgh to become a net zero city by 2030 and the key role active travel and modal shift must play as part of this, and for the need for projects Council and city-wide to reiterate our goals of inclusion and climate justice as outlined in the Business Plan.
- 6) To note the monitoring showed how "traffic on Comiston Road has not decreased in proportion to the increases observed on Braid Road and Hermitage Drive following the reopening of Braid Road to northbound traffic", exemplifying the theory of induced demand and suggesting that the reopening of roads to (vehicular) through traffic as part of any scheme redesign may lead to an increase in road traffic overall, undermining the objectives of the scheme as set out in point 5.
 - moved by Councillor O'Neill, seconded by Councillor Bandel

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion	-	6 votes
For the amendment	-	5 votes

(For the motion – Councillors Arthur, Cowdy, Dijkstra-Downie, Faccenda, Lang and Munro.

For the amendment – Councillors Aston, Bandel, Dobbin, McFarlane and O'Neill.)

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Arthur.

(References – Transport and Environment Committee 11 November 2021 (Item 1); 18 August 2022 (item 14) and 15 June 2023 (item 13); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted)

10. Response to motion by Councillor Bandel – Mobility Analysis

In response to a motion by Councillor Bandel, an update was provided on the benefits of the Smart City technology towards delivering the Council's City Mobility and associated action plan priorities to improve mobility analysis across the city.

Motion

To note the update on the capability of the Council's Smart Cities initiatives to improve mobility analysis across the city.

- moved by Councillor Arthur, seconded by Councillor Faccenda

Amendment

- 1) To note the update on the capability of the Council's Smart Cities initiatives to improve mobility analysis across the city.
- 2) To welcome, in particular, the opportunities the Smart Cities initiatives presented for the implementation of new pedestrian, cycle, and bus priority strategies.
- 3) To request a Business Bulletin Update by March 2024 on any progress made in developing these strategies.

- moved by Councillor Bandel, seconded by Councillor O'Neill

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, the amendment was accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Arthur:

- 1) To note the update on the capability of the Council's Smart Cities initiatives to improve mobility analysis across the city.
- 2) To welcome, in particular, the opportunities the Smart Cities initiatives presented for the implementation of new pedestrian, cycle, and bus priority strategies.
- 3) To request a Business Bulletin Update by March 2024 on any progress made in developing these strategies.

(References – Transport and Environment Committee 8 December 2022 (item ...); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

11. Response to Motion by Councillor Cowdy – Better Buses for Ratho

In response to a motion by Councillor Cowdy, an update was provided on current arrangements and plans to review the Council's supported bus service network including service provision to and from Ratho. The planned review would explore whether accessibility and connectivity issues elsewhere in the city could be enhanced (eg. for service provision in the Willowbrae area).

Motion

- 1) To note the update on current arrangements and plans to review the Council's supported bus service network, including service provision to/from Ratho.
 - 2) To note the review would also explore whether accessibility and connectivity issues elsewhere in the city could be enhanced (e.g. for service provision in the Willowbrae area).
- moved by Councillor Arthur, seconded by Councillor Faccenda

Amendment 1

- 1) To note the update on current arrangements and plans to review the Council's supported bus service network, including service provision to/from Ratho.
- 2) To note the review would also explore whether accessibility and connectivity issues elsewhere in the city could be enhanced (e.g. for service provision in the Willowbrae area).
- 3) To request ongoing updates to each Transport and Environment Committee via the Business Bulletin on current arrangements in Ratho and ongoing work to review, improve and retender.
- 4) To reiterate the direction given in the motion approved as amended at the 18 May 2023 Committee, namely:
 - that a PIN notice is issued to explore alternative provision prior to any formal procurement process, including examining whether input from officers with expertise in procurement can be utilised;
 - and that officers explore opportunities linking to local businesses and organisations, including RBS, Lost Shore and the Council-owned Edinburgh International Climbing Arena.

Thursday, 17th August, 2023

- 5) To further request that full use be made of the large amount of valuable work that had been done by the Ratho Bus Working Group, which include analysis of all supported bus routes operated by McGills (20, 63 and 68), in producing this procurement process.

- moved by Councillor Aston, seconded by Councillor McFarlane

Amendment 2

- 1) To note the update on current arrangements and plans to review the Council's supported bus service network, including service provision to/from Ratho.
- 2) To note the review would also explore whether accessibility and connectivity issues elsewhere in the city could be enhanced (e.g. for service provision in the Willowbrae area).
- 3) To note the review and retendering process for existing and any new supported services was envisaged to be complete by the end of 2023, with an award of new contracts in January 2024; to recognise the importance of adhering to this timeframe given the ongoing concerns over supported services; and to agree that officers should inform the Committee and relevant ward councillors at the earliest possible stage if this timetable would not be achieved.

- moved by Councillor Lang, seconded by Councillor Dijkstra-Downie

Amendment 3

- 1) To note the update on current arrangements and plans to review the Council's supported bus service network, including service provision to/from Ratho.
- 2) To note the review would also explore whether accessibility and connectivity issues elsewhere in the city could be enhanced (e.g. for service provision in the Willowbrae area).
- 3) To agree that the outcomes of the review of supported bus services should promote accessibility and social inclusion, for example by providing access to health services, employment, leisure and shopping for older people, disabled people, and those from areas of social deprivation and high unemployment.
- 4) To ask that any framework used to inform recommendations for tender and the development of alternative route and service options should include equalities criteria that support the aims above.

- moved by Councillor Bandel, seconded by Councillor O'Neill

Amendment 4

- 1) To note the update on current arrangements and plans to review the Council's supported bus service network, including service provision to/from Ratho.

Thursday, 17th August, 2023

- 2) To note the review would also explore whether accessibility and connectivity issues elsewhere in the city could be enhanced (e.g. for service provision in the Willowbrae area).
- 3) To note Committee was disappointed at the slow pace of delivering on the actions set out in the Motion approved in May 2023, particularly:
 - Identifying and providing a suitable solution for the residents of Ratho.
 - Arranging meetings with i) RBS Gogar and ii) McGill's, composed of the Ratho Bus Work Group, council officers, Pentland Hills ward councillors, and the Transport and Environment Committee Convener.
- 4) To request regular Business Bulletin updates at future Committee meetings with the next one outlining delivery milestones.
 - moved by Councillor Cowdy, seconded by Councillor Munro

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, Amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 were adjusted and accepted as addenda to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor Arthur:

- 1) To note the update on current arrangements and plans to review the Council's supported bus service network, including service provision to/from Ratho.
- 2) To note the review would also explore whether accessibility and connectivity issues elsewhere in the city could be enhanced (e.g. for service provision in the Willowbrae area).
- 3) To request ongoing concise updates to each Transport and Environment Committee meeting via the Business Bulletin on current arrangements in Ratho and ongoing work to review, improve and retender.
- 4) To reiterate the direction given in the motion approved as amended at the 18 May 2023 Committee, namely:
 - that a PIN notice is issued to explore alternative provision prior to any formal procurement process, including examining whether input from officers with expertise in procurement can be utilised.
 - and that officers explore opportunities linking to local businesses and organisations, including RBS, Lost Shore and the Council-owned Edinburgh International Climbing Arena.
- 5) To further request that full use be made of the large amount of valuable work that had been done by the Ratho Bus Working Group, which includes analysis

Thursday, 17th August, 2023

of all supported bus routes operated by McGills (20, 63 and 68), in producing this procurement process.

- 7) To note the review and retendering process for existing and any new supported services was envisaged to be complete by the end of 2023, with an award of new contracts in January 2024; to recognise the importance of adhering to this timeframe given the ongoing concerns over supported services; and to agree that officers should inform the Committee and relevant ward councillors at the earliest possible stage if this timetable would not be achieved.
- 8) To agree that the outcomes of the review of supported bus services should support isolated communities and also promote accessibility and social inclusion, for example by providing access to health services, employment, leisure and shopping for older people, disabled people, and those from areas of social deprivation and high unemployment.
- 9) To ask that any framework used to inform recommendations for tender and the development of alternative route and service options should include equalities criteria that support the aims above.
- 10) To note Committee was disappointed at the slow pace of delivering on the actions set out in the Motion approved in May 2023, particularly:
 - Identifying and providing a suitable solution for the residents of Ratho.
 - Arranging meetings with i) RBS Gogar and ii) McGill's, composed of the Ratho Bus Work Group, council officers, Pentland Hills ward councillors, and the Transport and Environment Committee Convener.
- 11) To request monthly Business Bulletin updates at future Committee meetings with the next one outlining delivery milestones.

(References – Transport and Environment Committee 18 May 2023 (item 15); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

12. Circular Economy (Scotland) Bill - Draft Consultation Response

Approval was sought to submit a draft response to the Scottish Government's Consultation on the Circular Economy (Scotland) Bill as set out in appendix 1 of the report by the Executive Director of Place.

Decision

To approve the draft consultation response for submission to the Scottish Government on 18 August 2023.

(References – Transport and Environment Committee 18 August 2022 (item 5); report by the Executive Director of Place, submitted.)

Declaration of interests

Councillor Dobbin made a transparency statement in respect of the above item of business as an employee of an organisation that specialised in circular technology.

Councillor O'Neill made a transparency statement in respect of the above item of business as an employee of the MSP responsible for bringing the Circular Economy (Scotland) Bill in her role as minister.

13. Motion by Councillor Lang - Reducing the Impact of Utility Works

The following motion by Councillor Lang was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

“Committee:

- 1) Notes the ongoing concern within local communities over the impact of significant utility works, which can often result in footway closures, full or partial carriageway closures, temporary traffic lights, and other changes.
- 2) Recognises the importance and legal right of utility companies to repair and upgrade their infrastructure but notes the limited powers of local authorities in Scotland to minimise the disruptive consequences of such works and ensure works are completed as quickly as possible.
- 3) Notes that some local councils in other parts of the UK are now using a 'per day' charge on utility companies for road and footway occupations in a bid to incentivise the timely completion of works.
- 4) Agrees that officers should explore all avenues with Transport Scotland and the Scottish Government, either to maximise the use of existing legal powers or to seek additional powers like those now used elsewhere, to ensure Edinburgh and other councils have the broadest range of mechanisms to reduce the impact of utility works.
- 5) Agrees that the outcome of this work should be reported back to committee through the business bulletin.”

Decision

To approve the motion by Councillor Lang.

14. Motion by Councillor O'Neill - Reinforcing the Equal Pavements Pledge

The following motion by Councillor O'Neill was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

- “1) Notes motions from Councillor Claire Miller, ‘Equal Pavements Pledge’ which passed during Full Council on 23rd September 2021, motion by Councillor Derek Howie on ‘Street Furniture’ which passed during Full Council on 25th November 2021, and motion by Councillor Lesley Macinnes, ‘Accessibility Commission’ which passed during Full Council on 30th June 2022.
- 2) Understands that by passing these motions the Council agreed to support Transport For All’s pledge, meetings were requested with the Edinburgh Access Panel, and a report was requested looking at the impact of street furniture on ‘blind and visually impaired people, the wider disabled community and parents with buggies [...] and how this should be aligned with [Cllr. Miller’s] motion.’
- 3) Further notes questions to Full Council on 4th May 2023 from Councillor Kayleigh O'Neill where reassurance was given regarding strategic context, A-boards, bin scheduling, dropped crossings and engagement with Disabled People’s Organisations (DPOs).
- 4) Regrets that the majority of these pledges are not being met and reliable accessibility has deteriorated in recent years despite multiple updates to local and national guidance. This has led to complaints, injuries, discrimination, isolation and, as recent reports have found, insurance claims costing the city over £80,000 since 2018.
- 5) Agrees that more work is needed to address access considerations – i.e. surfacing, gradients, barrier-free access, continuity, directions, and crossings – in future guidance reviews and all work streams.
- 6) Reaffirms the Committee’s support for the Equal Pavements Pledge and informs the Accessible Streets Roundtable Discussion Forum of this, requesting it consider including the Pledge in its draft terms of reference and the following points as part of its discussions on an Accessibility Commission:
 - a) How we will continue to ‘Listen, and act’ off the back of engagement with disabled people, across impairment groups, who have been significantly erased from the conversation, and look at how our engagement processes themselves are often barriers to disabled people.
 - b) How we will work with Planning and Licensing colleagues to ‘Keep it Clear’ and maintain a minimum of 1.5m clearance on all pavements, especially during high-footfall seasons (August and December), with detail on the different street types.
 - c) How we will ‘Cut the clutter’ and operate a zero-tolerance approach to street clutter, especially during high-footfall seasons, with detail on the different street types.

Thursday, 17th August, 2023

- d) How we will 'Mind the trash', reducing the issue of bags of rubbish being left on pavements, especially during high-footfall seasons.
- e) How we will address the issue of improper and missing dropped kerbs across the city, with reference to short term solutions for problematic areas, and longer-term plans on how we 'Drop the kerbs' and audit our street space for further accessibility concerns.
- f) How we will 'Protect Blue Badge Bays' and ensure residents or visitors that require accessible parking have full information on where they can park and drive in the city.
- g) Finally, how the Council will continue to 'Work with disabled experts', acknowledging that disabled people's lived experience and the integration of the Social Model of Disability is the answer to delivering all future street space schemes with accessibility at the core."

Motion

To approve the motion by Councillor O'Neill.

- moved by Councillor O'Neill, seconded by Councillor Bandel

Amendment

To add after point 6:

- 7) Notes that the Edinburgh Accessibility Commission will set its own terms of reference.
 - 8) Requests a brief update before the end of 2023 on the 'Equal Pavements Pledge' and 'Street Furniture' motions noted in Point 1.
- moved by Councillor Arthur, seconded by Councillor Faccenda

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, the amendment was adjusted and accepted as an addendum to the motion.

Decision

To approve the following adjusted motion by Councillor O'Neill:

- 1) To note motions from Councillor Claire Miller, 'Equal Pavements Pledge' which passed during Full Council on 23rd September 2021, motion by Councillor Derek Howie on 'Street Furniture' which passed during Full Council on 25th November 2021, and motion by Councillor Lesley Macinnes, 'Accessibility Commission' which passed during Full Council on 30th June 2022.
- 2) To understand that by passing these motions the Council agreed to support Transport For All's pledge, meetings were requested with the Edinburgh Access Panel, and a report was requested looking at the impact of street furniture on 'blind and visually impaired people, the wider disabled community

and parents with buggies [...] and how this should be aligned with [Cllr. Miller's] motion.'

- 3) To further note questions to Full Council on 4th May 2023 from Councillor Kayleigh O'Neill where reassurance was given regarding strategic context, A-boards, bin scheduling, dropped crossings and engagement with Disabled People's Organisations (DPOs).
- 4) To regret that the majority of these pledges were not being met and reliable accessibility had deteriorated in recent years despite multiple updates to local and national guidance. This had led to complaints, injuries, discrimination, isolation and, as recent reports found, insurance claims costing the city over £80,000 since 2018.
- 5) To agree that more work was needed to address access considerations – i.e. surfacing, gradients, barrier-free access, continuity, directions, and crossings – in future guidance reviews and all work streams.
- 6) To reaffirm the Committee's support for the Equal Pavements Pledge and to inform the Accessible Streets Roundtable Discussion Forum of this, requesting it consider including the Pledge in its draft terms of reference and the following points as part of its discussions on an Accessibility Commission:
 - a) How we would continue to 'Listen, and act' off the back of engagement with disabled people, across impairment groups, who have been significantly erased from the conversation, and look at how our engagement processes themselves are often barriers to disabled people.
 - b) How we would work with Planning and Licensing colleagues to 'Keep it Clear' and maintain a minimum of 1.5m clearance on all pavements, especially during high-footfall seasons (August and December), with detail on the different street types.
 - c) How we would 'Cut the clutter' and operate a zero-tolerance approach to street clutter, especially during high-footfall seasons, with detail on the different street types.
 - d) How we would 'Mind the trash', reducing the issue of bags of rubbish being left on pavements, especially during high-footfall seasons.
 - e) How we would address the issue of improper and missing dropped kerbs across the city, with reference to short term solutions for problematic areas, and longer-term plans on how we 'Drop the kerbs' and audit our street space for further accessibility concerns.
 - f) How we would 'Protect Blue Badge Bays' and ensure residents or visitors that require accessible parking have full information on where they could park and drive in the city.

- g) Finally, how the Council would continue to 'Work with disabled experts', acknowledging that disabled people's lived experience and the integration of the Social Model of Disability was the answer to delivering all future street space schemes with accessibility at the core.
- 7) To note that the Edinburgh Accessibility Commission would set its own terms of reference.
- 8) To request a brief update before the end of 2023 on the 'Equal Pavements Pledge' and 'Street Furniture' motions noted in Point 1.

15. Motion by Councillor Bandel - Staff Resourcing for the City Mobility Plan

The following motion by Councillor Bandel was submitted in terms of Standing Order 17:

- "1) Notes that workload across the Transport service area has been increasing which necessitated the change from 8-weekly to 4-weekly Transport and Environment Committee meetings agreed at the City of Edinburgh Council meeting in December 2023.
- 2) Notes with concern that these increased demands on officer time have not been matched by a proportionate investment in staffing. Further notes repeated warnings by officers that several key teams are under extreme pressure and lacking the staff capacity to deliver projects to agreed timescales.
- 3) Regrets that these pressures are causing delays in the delivery of the City Mobility Plan and other key areas of work that are crucial to meeting the Council's car km reduction targets and achieving its climate target of Net Zero by 2030.
- 4) Further regrets the unacceptable negative impact on staff wellbeing the lack of resourcing has been causing.
- 5) Requests officers to provide all political groups with information detailing the investment in staffing needed to deliver the City Mobility Plan 2021-2030 on time for consideration as part of the Council's 2024/25 budget setting process by October. This should include information about how roles should be prioritised for investment / recruitment, taking into account the sustainable transport hierarchy."

Motion

To approve the motion by Councillor Bandel.

- moved by Councillor Bandel, seconded by Councillor O'Neill

Amendment 1

To replace Point 1 with:

- 1) Notes that the Transport and Environment Committee changed from bi-monthly to monthly meetings as agreed by a majority of Councillors at the City of Edinburgh Council meeting in December 2022, and that this generated additional workload for Council Officers. Notes that many of the reports coming to the Transport and Environment Committee are the result of motions from Committee members or from full Council (4 of the 7 reports this month), and the remit receives several written questions at each Full Council. Notes that these incremental pressures have exacerbated the impact of years of cuts forced on Edinburgh.

To replace Point 4 with:

- 4) 'Further regrets the unacceptable negative impact on staff wellbeing across the council the lack of resourcing has been causing over many years, and therefore welcomes the work of Trade Unions to raise concerns about this aspect of the underfunding of Local Authorities in Scotland.'

To add:

- 6) Asks that any such delays noted in Point 3 are quantified in the briefing requested in Point 5.
- 7) Asks that the briefing covers staffing in all of the Transport Environment Committee remit and explains how the profile has changed since 2017.
 - moved by Councillor Arthur, seconded by Councillor Bandel

Amendment 2

- 1) In paragraph 1, delete "2023" and insert "2022".
- 2) In paragraph 2, after "staffing", insert:

“, a situation impacted by the ongoing cuts forced on the Council by the SNP / Green coalition government”.
- 3) inserts new paragraph 5 and renumbers accordingly:

‘5. regrets that, at the time of the approval of the City Mobility Plan in 2021, a majority of councillors on the committee voted against an amendment seeking “the broad estimated financial requirements and resource implications” of the Plan, and recognises how this information would have been useful from an early stage.’
- 4) In current paragraph 5 (new paragraph 6);
 - a) delete “investment in staffing” and insert “broad additional operational and capital investment”.

- b) delete “October” and insert “by the end of 2023”.
- c) delete “how roles should be prioritised”, and insert, “the estimated additional human resource required”.

- Moved by Councillor Lang, seconded by Councillor Dijkstra-Downie

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, Amendments 1 and 2 were adjusted and accepted as addenda to the motion.

In accordance with Standing Order 22.12, Amendment 2 was adjusted and accepted as an addendum to Amendment 1.

Voting

The voting was as follows:

For the motion (as adjusted)	-	5 votes
For Amendment 1 (as adjusted)	-	6 votes

(For the motion (as adjusted) – Councillors Aston, Bandel, Dobbin, McFarlane and O’Neill.

For the amendment (as adjusted) – Councillors Arthur, Cowdy, Dijkstra-Downie, Faccenda, Lang and Munro.)

Decision

To approve the following adjusted Amendment 1 by Councillor Arthur:

- 1) To note that the Transport and Environment Committee changed from bi-monthly to monthly meetings as agreed by a majority of Councillors at the City of Edinburgh Council meeting in December 2022, and that this generated additional workload for Council Officers. To note that many of the reports coming to the Transport and Environment Committee are the result of motions from Committee members or from full Council (4 of the 7 reports this month), and the remit received several written questions at each Full Council meeting. To note that these incremental pressures have exacerbated the impact of years of cuts forced on Edinburgh.
- 2) To note with concern that these increased demands on officer time had not been matched by a proportionate investment in staffing, a situation impacted by the ongoing cuts forced on the Council by the SNP / Green coalition government. To further note repeated warnings by officers that several key teams were under extreme pressure and lacking the staff capacity to deliver projects to agreed timescales.
- 3) To regret that these pressures were causing delays in the delivery of the City Mobility Plan and other key areas of work that were crucial to meeting the Council’s car km reduction targets and achieving its climate target of Net Zero by 2030.

Thursday, 17th August, 2023

- 4) To further regret the unacceptable negative impact on staff wellbeing across the council that the lack of resourcing had been causing over many years, and to therefore welcome the work of Trade Unions to raise concerns about this aspect of the underfunding of Local Authorities in Scotland.
 - 4a) To regret that, at the time of the approval of the City Mobility Plan in 2021, a majority of councillors on the committee voted against an amendment seeking “the broad estimated financial requirements and resource implications” of the Plan, and to recognise how this information would have been useful from an early stage.
- 5) To request officers provide all political groups with information detailing the broad additional operational and capital investment needed to deliver the City Mobility Plan 2021-2030 in time for consideration as part of the Council's 2024/25 budget setting process by the end of 2023. This should include information about the estimated additional human resource required for investment / recruitment, taking into account the sustainable transport hierarchy.
- 6) To ask that any such delays noted in Point 3 were quantified in the briefing requested in Point 5.
- 7) To ask that the briefing covered staffing in all of the Transport and Environment Committee remit and explained how the profile had changed since 2017.